



Historical Commission

Regular

~ Minutes ~

36 Court Street
Springfield, MA 01103
<http://www.springfieldcityhall.com>

Vincent Walsh

Thursday, June 20, 2024

5:30 PM

Richard Neal Municipal Operations Center

I. Call to Order

5:30 PM Meeting called to order on June 20, 2024 at Richard Neal Municipal Operations Center, 70 Tapley Street, Springfield, MA.

Attendee Name	Title	Status	Arrived
Vincent Walsh	Chair, RAPV Representative	Present	
Alfonso Nardi	Vice-Chair	Present	
Judith Crowell	CPC Representative	Absent	
Walter Kroll		Present	
Marisa Zorzi		Absent	
Vana Nespor		Present	

II. Acceptance of Minutes

1. Thursday, June 06, 2024

III. Public Hearings (Continued)

1. Petition (ID # 7901)

91-97 Chestnut Street

91-97 Chestnut Street: Installation of murals to either side of building

HISTORY:

02/15/24 Historical Commission CONTINUE VOTE

03/21/24 Historical Commission CONTINUE VOTE

Next: 04/04/24

04/04/24 Historical Commission CONTINUE VOTE

Next: 04/18/24

04/18/24 Historical Commission CONTINUE VOTE

Next: 05/02/24

05/02/24 Historical Commission CONTINUE VOTE

Next: 05/16/24

05/16/24 Historical Commission CONTINUE VOTE

Next: 06/06/24

06/06/24 Historical Commission CONTINUE VOTE

Next: 06/20/24

COMMENTS - Current Meeting:

Discussion: Commissioner Walsh asked planning staff how much time was left on the application. Principal Planner Alvin Allen stated that the application deadline was July 24th.

Public Comments: None

Motion: To continue the application to the next available meeting (07/18/2024)

Decision: Continued

RESULT:	CONTINUE VOTE [4 TO 0]	Next: 7/18/2024 5:30 PM
AYES:	Vincent Walsh, Alfonso Nardi, Walter Kroll, Vana Nespor	
ABSENT:	Judith Crowell, Marisa Zorzi	

2. Petition (ID # 8069)

144 Buckingham Street

144 Buckingham Street: Replacement windows

HISTORY:

06/06/24 Historical Commission **CONTINUE VOTE**
Next: 06/20/24

COMMENTS - Current Meeting:

Discussion: Linda Wallace and a representative from Home Depot spoke on the matter. The representative stated that they could change the color of the window to either black or bronze. The representative added that they could add exterior grids to match the original windows and presented a picture of the proposed windows to the Commission. The Representative stated that the sill of the window would be almost flush to the window and presented a picture of the proposed window to the Commission. Commissioner Walsh asked what the model of the proposed windows would be to which the representative stated the proposed windows were Provia Endure series models.

Public Comments: None

Motion: To approve the application for a certificate of appropriateness

Decision: Approved

RESULT:	APPROVED [4 TO 0]
AYES:	Vincent Walsh, Alfonso Nardi, Walter Kroll, Vana Nespor
ABSENT:	Judith Crowell, Marisa Zorzi

3. Petition (ID # 8071)

29 George Street

29 George Street: Replacement windows and rear porch renovations

HISTORY:**06/06/24****Historical Commission CONTINUE VOTE****Next: 06/20/24****COMMENTS - Current Meeting:**

Discussion: Jada Miller spoke on the matter. Ms. Miller stated that the window portion of the application would be withdrawn. Additionally, she stated that the window were not being replaced but would, instead, be repaired and re-installed in the same location where previously located. Commissioner Kroll then asked Principal Planner Alvin Allen if the petitioners were able to withdraw that portion from the application. Mr. Allen stated that the petitioners could, and added that if the windows were being replaced that the petitioner would need to return before the Commission.

Public Comments: David Gaby spoke in favor of the application

Motion: To approve the application for a certificate of appropriateness for spindle installation only, spindles to be painted within one-year

Decision: Approved

RESULT: APPROVED [4 TO 0]**AYES:** Vincent Walsh, Alfonso Nardi, Walter Kroll, Vana Nespor**ABSENT:** Judith Crowell, Marisa Zorzi**4. Petition (ID # 8099)**

55 Emery Street

55 Emery Street: Remediation of window exterior color**COMMENTS - Current Meeting:**

Discussion: David Bornstein spoke on the matter. Mr. Bornstein stated that, due to the warmer weather, he would not be able to paint the new windows yet, and requested a continuation of the matter.

Public Comments: None

Motion: To continue the application to the next available meeting (07/18/2024)

Decision: Continued

RESULT:	CONTINUE VOTE [4 TO 0]	Next: 7/18/2024 5:30 PM
AYES:	Vincent Walsh, Alfonso Nardi, Walter Kroll, Vana Nespor	
ABSENT:	Judith Crowell, Marisa Zorzi	

IV. Public Hearings (New)

1. Petition (ID # 8100)

55 Emery Street

55 Emery Street: Installation of sliding door on Columbus Avenue entryway

COMMENTS - Current Meeting:

Discussion: David Bornstein spoke on the matter. Mr. Bornstein stated that, due to accessibility concerns, he was proposing to install a sliding door to the East Columbus façade of the building. Commissioner Walsh asked if the Commission could see a current picture of the proposed location of the sliding doors to which one was presented. Mr. Bornstein also stated that the color of the proposed sliding doors would be an anodized aluminum. Mr. Bornstein stated that the color was chosen in order to match the existing sliding door adjacent on the non-historic portion of the structure, then presented an image of the already approved sliding doors to the Commission.

Public Comments: David Gaby spoke in favor of the application

Motion: To approve the application for a certificate of hardship

Decision: Approved

RESULT:	APPROVED [4 TO 0]
AYES:	Vincent Walsh, Alfonso Nardi, Walter Kroll, Vana Nespor
ABSENT:	Judith Crowell, Marisa Zorzi

2. Petition (ID # 8101)

14 Fairfield Street

14 Fairfield Street: Demolish and rebuild front porch

COMMENTS - Current Meeting:

Discussion: Nathan Andary spoke on the matter. Mr. Andary stated that he was proposing to demolish the existing front porch structure of the house, and construct a new front porch that would replicate the design of the original front porch structure. Mr. Andary also stated that he would be using the same materials that composed the original front porch for the proposed front porch. Commissioner Nardi asked if the decking of the proposed front porch would be tongue and groove flooring. Mr. Andary stated that he could install tongue and groove flooring if that was more acceptable to the

Commission. Commissioner Nardi asked if the front porch columns of the proposed front porch would match the original front porch column caps to which Mr. Andary stated yes.

Public Comments: None

Motion: To approve the application for a certificate of appropriateness (with conditions as follows: front porch column caps to match original design and installation of tongue & groove flooring to match original)

Decision: Approved

RESULT:	APPROVED [4 TO 0]
AYES:	Vincent Walsh, Alfonso Nardi, Walter Kroll, Vana Nespor
ABSENT:	Judith Crowell, Marisa Zorzi

3. Petition (ID # 8102)

33 Avon Place

33 Avon Place: Replacement of two windows

COMMENTS - Current Meeting:

Discussion: Chad Menton spoke on behalf of the petitioner. Mr. Menton stated that he was proposing to replace and install two vinyl windows on the house. Commissioner Walsh asked Mr. Menton if the proposed windows would replicate the design, and style of the original windows to which Mr. Menton stated yes. Mr. Menton asked the Commission if the proposed windows needed to be dark in color to which Commissioner Walsh stated yes.

Public Comments: None

Motion: To approve the application for a certificate of appropriateness

Decision: Approved

RESULT:	APPROVED [4 TO 0]
AYES:	Vincent Walsh, Alfonso Nardi, Walter Kroll, Vana Nespor
ABSENT:	Judith Crowell, Marisa Zorzi

4. Petition (ID # 8103)

137 Forest Park Avenue

137 Forest Park Avenue: Solar installation

COMMENTS - Current Meeting:

Discussion: Steve Spengler spoke on behalf of the petitioner. Mr. Spengler stated he was proposing to install 10 panels on the front and rear of the house. Mr. Spengler stated that the conduits would primarily be located on the rear of property but would be painted to match the exterior color of the house. Commissioner Walsh asked if the plan was to run a conduit at the top of the roof to which Mr. Spengler stated yes but that the conduits could be located in a more non-visible location if needed. Commissioner Walsh recommended that the conduits come underneath the rooftop and then exit out underneath rear eaves of the house. Commissioner Nardi then asked if the proposed solar panels could be set-back more and thereby less visible to which Mr. Spengler stated that would be difficult to do given the design of the house's roof.

Public Comments: Sheryl Rueli spoke in opposition to the application, David Gaby spoke in opposition to the application, Mike Soroski spoke in favor of the application

Motion: To approve the application for a certificate of appropriateness (with conditions as follows: conduits to run underneath the rear eaves of the house and be painted to match the exterior of the house)

Decision: Approved

RESULT:	APPROVED [4 TO 0]
AYES:	Vincent Walsh, Alfonso Nardi, Walter Kroll, Vana Nespor
ABSENT:	Judith Crowell, Marisa Zorzi

5. Petition (ID # 8104)

43 Ingersoll Grove

43 Ingersoll Grove: Replacement windows and replace cedar shakes with vinyl siding

COMMENTS - Current Meeting:

43 Ingersoll Grove

Discussion: Matt Beisler and Mike Soroski spoke on the matter. Mr. Beisler stated that he was proposing to replace a damaged window on his house with a Silverline V3 series vinyl window. Mr. Beisler stated that the proposed window would match the existing vinyl windows that were installed without the approval of the Commission. Mr. Beisler stated that he was also proposing to replace damaged cedar shake shingles on his house with vinyl clapboard siding. Mr. Soroski then stated that the existing siding was damaged beyond repair and was causing significant damage to the house due to water leakage. Mr. Beisler then presented photos of the damaged siding and trim to the Commission. Mr. Beisler stated that due to the high cost of materials he could not afford to replace or repair the original cedar shake shingles with new cedar shake shingles. Mr. Beisler also stated that he could not replace

the shingles with vinyl models that replicated the style and design of the original shingles due to the high cost of materials. Mr. Beisler then stated that vinyl clapboard models were his only financially feasible option. Commissioner Walsh stated that although the house itself is not historic, that the owner should attempt to blend into the historic district. Commissioner Walsh went on to state that he did not want an unnecessary burden to be placed on a non-historic house just because it is located in a historic district. Mr. Soroski stated that the houses adjacent to the property also contained vinyl clap board shingles, and stated that the proposed clapboard siding would actually match other houses in the neighborhood. Commissioner Walsh then stated that the design of other houses should not be factored into the proposed designs of houses located in historic districts. Commissioner Walsh added that the goal, when performing work in historic districts, should be to mimic the unique style and design of the houses themselves rather than trying to make them match the appearance of other houses. Commissioner Walsh then questioned Mr. Beisler what color the proposed window would be. Mr. Beisler stated that the proposed window would be white vinyl, but that he would be willing to change the color to a darker color model. Commissioner Kroll stated that the proposed window should be one that does not compromise the historical integrity of the district. Commissioner Nespor stated that historical colors like a wood grain or black could make the vinyl models appear as though they are wooden and thus more historical. Commissioner Nespor stated that the texture of the vinyl clapboard could also be altered to model a wooden grain model. Mr. Beisler stated that he was open to that solution for the windows. Commissioner Walsh then recommended that if Mr. Beisler was replacing additional windows that the new windows match the proposed window model in color and design, if the window was approved tonight. Commissioner Walsh then advised that the Commission continue the siding matter to the next meeting and allow for Mr. Beisler to collect more information on possible siding options, then vote on the window. Commissioner Nardi added that replacing the shingles with clapboard siding would ruin the character of the neighborhood and would be better to find an option that matched the original shingle siding of the house. Commissioner Walsh then asked Mr. Beisler if the solution of separating the two items would be acceptable. Mr. Beisler stated yes.

Public Comments: James Boone spoke in opposition to the application (by letter), David Gaby spoke in favor of the window item of the application and in opposition to the siding item of the application, Sheryl Rueli spoke in favor of the application, Steven Howard spoke in favor of the application, Harry Seymour spoke in favor of the application.

Motion: To approve the application for a certificate of hardship for the window item only, to continue the siding item of the application to the next available meeting

Decision: Application for windows **approved**, Application for siding **continued** to the next meeting (07/18/2024)

RESULT:	APPROVED [4 TO 0]
AYES:	Vincent Walsh, Alfonso Nardi, Walter Kroll, Vana Nespor
ABSENT:	Judith Crowell, Marisa Zorzi

V. Environmental Reviews

1. Petition (ID # 8105)

134 Catharine Street

134 Catharine Street: Aluminum siding either to be repaired or replaced with vinyl

COMMENTS - Current Meeting:

Discussion: City Planning staff presented the opinion of the Commission's Historic Preservation Consultant, Shannon Walsh, to the Commission on the matter. Maricely Vega spoke on the matter. Ms. Vega stated that their intention was to repair the existing siding per the recommendation of Ms. Walsh. Commissioner Walsh stated that would be appropriate as, in his opinion, they were keeping the property the same and were not making alterations to the siding.

Public Comments: None

Motion: To issue a decision of no adverse impact for the proposed project

Decision: No adverse impact

RESULT:	APPROVED [4 TO 0]
AYES:	Vincent Walsh, Alfonso Nardi, Walter Kroll, Vana Nespor
ABSENT:	Judith Crowell, Marisa Zorzi

VI. Preservation of Historically Significant Buildings

VII. Others Matters Properly Before the Commission

1. Informational (ID # 8033)

101 State Street (Section 106 Review)

101 State Street (Section 106 Review): Antenna installation

HISTORY:

05/16/24 Historical Commission COMMITTEE

06/06/24 Historical Commission

COMMENTS - Current Meeting:

Discussion: City Planning staff informed the Commission that the project manager was unable to obtain permission to speak on the project, and therefore could not

attend the Commission meeting. Commissioner Walsh recommended that the matter be continued to give the project manager more time to obtain a letter of authorization from the property owner.

Public Comments: None

Motion: To continue the matter to the next available meeting (07/18/2024)

Decision: Continued

2. Informational (ID # 8106)

85 Westminster Street (Non-Applicability)

85 Westminster Street (Non-Applicability): Renovations to roof, gutter, and chimney

COMMENTS - Current Meeting:

Discussion: Cindy Albino spoke on the matter. Ms. Albino stated that she was proposing to make roof, gutter and chimney repairs to the house with no change in design and material to the original roof and chimney.

Public Comments: None

Motion: To issue a certificate of non-applicability

Decision: Approved

RESULT: RECEIVED THE REPORT - UNANIMOUS

3. Informational (ID # 8107)

47 Riverview Street (Non-Applicability)

47 Riverview Street (Non-Applicability): Repairs to siding and masonry / exterior paint

COMMENTS - Current Meeting:

Discussion: Sheryl Rueli spoke on the matter. The scope of work packet for the project was presented by the City's Planning staff to the Commission.

Public Comments: None

Motion: To issue a certificate of non-applicability

Decision: Approved

RESULT: RECEIVED THE REPORT - UNANIMOUS

4. Informational (ID # 8108)

54 Fairfield Street (Non-Applicability)

54 Fairfield Street (Non-Applicability): Several exterior renovations

COMMENTS - Current Meeting:

Discussion: Charlie and Takia Lee spoke on the matter. The scope of work packet for the project was presented by the City's Planning staff to the Commission.

Public Comments: None

Motion: To issue a certificate of non-applicability

Decision: Approved

RESULT: RECEIVED THE REPORT - UNANIMOUS

5. Informational (ID # 8109)

62 Westminster Street

62 Westminster Street: Requesting letter of support for proposed Massachusetts Preservation Project Fund

COMMENTS - Current Meeting:

Discussion: David Gaby spoke on the matter. Mr. Gaby presented on the ongoing project to repair the carriage house and restore it to its original form. Mr. Gaby stated that he was requesting a letter, and/or indication of support submitted to the Massachusetts Preservation Project. Mr. Gaby then provided photos of the existing structure and the damaged areas of the carriage house.

Public Comments: None

Motions: To write a letter of support and/or sign a form in support of the project

Decision: Approved

RESULT: RECEIVED THE REPORT - UNANIMOUS

6. Informational (ID # 8110)

Public Speak-Out Session

Public Speak-Out Session**COMMENTS - Current Meeting:**

Discussion: Steven Howard spoke to raise awareness of the need to repair and rehabilitate the property of 62 Westminster Street. Mr. Howard also spoke on importance of the preservation of historic properties. Harry Seymour spoke to raise the issue of properties located in historic districts that have allegedly conducted unauthorized work. Commissioner Nardi advised Mr. Seymour to utilize social media as a means of raising public awareness for the alleged unauthorized work being done to historic homes. Dave Gaby spoke to raise concerns about the use of inappropriate materials on historic homes. Mr. Gaby also raised concerns surrounding the structure of the public comment section of the public hearings portion of the Commission's meetings.